

Item 2.8: Recommendations from the *Vision for Success* Diversity, Equity and Inclusion TaskForce

Attachments:5

Date:September 1617, 2019

Category: Executive Office

Type of Board Consideration:Action

Recommended By

Approved for Consideration

Dr. Daisy Gonzales, Deputy Chancellor

Eloy Ortiz Oakley, Chancellor

Vision for Success Diversity, Equity and Inclusion TaskForce

Recommendation

It is recommended that the Board of Governors approve Resolution Number 2019-19:

Be it Resolved, that the Board of Governors of the California Community Colleges,

- x Accepts the proposed Diversity, Equity and Inclusion Integration Plan to integrate diversity, equity and inclusion into the *Vision for Success* and directs the Chancellor's Office to present a preliminary timeline for the Diversity, Equity and Inclusion Integration Plan to the Board of Governors at the January 2020 Board meeting, with a description of the implementation team and a possible recommendation for additional oversight, based upon the 202021 Budget outlook;
- x Adopts the proposed California Community Colleges Diversity, Equity and Inclusion Statement and directs the Chancellor's Office to propose changes to title V, the mission of the California Community College system, Equal Employment Opportunity plans, and multiple measures certification forms by September 2020d
- x Supports the 202021 budget proposal submitted by the TaskForce, to augment statewide resources that will advance the implementation of the Diversity, Equity and Inclusion Integration Plan.

force was sparked by a statewide study by the Campaign for College Opportunity (collegecampaign.org/wp-content/uploads/2018/03/2018Left-Out-ExecutiveSummary-Final.pdf) which found that in the California Community College system, the demographics of campus faculty and senior leadership is not representative of the racial

- x Irma Ramos, ACHRO, North Orange CCD
- x Greg Smith, ACHRO, Shasta College
- x Hildegard B. Aguinaldo, Board of Governors Member
- x Alexis Zaragoza, Board of Governors Student Member
- x Dr. Daisy Gonzales, Chancellor's Office-(Chair)
- x Fermin Villegas, Chancellor's Office
- x Ebony Lopez, Chancellor's Office
- x SandyFried, Foundation for California Community Colleges Success Center
- x Nadia LealCarrillo, Foundation for California Community Colleges Success Center
- x Dr. Devon Graves, Foundation for California Community Colleges Success Center

The Task force met for six months from April through September of 2019. Specifically, the Taskforce met on April 8, May 17, June 24, July 19, August 22, and September 4. Throughout the process, the Taskforce engaged additional statewide stakeholders to learn more about unconscious bias, and policies and practices that support faculty of color retention. The statewide experts who presented to the Taskforce include:

- x Eugene Whitlock. May 17, 2019 meeting presentation on "Addressing Unconscious Bias: Why it Matters for How We Hire and How We Teach."
- x Dr. Luke Lara, Mira Costa College. July 19, 2019 panel moderator for "Faculty of Color Retention."
- x Dr. Maria Figueroa, Mira Costa College. July 19, 2019 panelist on "Faculty of Color Retention."
- x Dr. Karen Chow, DeAnza College. July 19, 2019 panelist on "Faculty of Color Retention."
- x Dr. Manuel Velez, San Diego Mesa College. July 19, 2019 panelist on "Faculty of Color Retention."
- x Dr. Edward Pohlert, Mira Costa College. July 19, 2019 panelist on "Faculty of Color Retention."

Analysis

The Landscape of Diversity Efforts

With the help of the Success Center at the Foundation for California Community Colleges and Chancellor's Office staff, the Task force reviewed academic literature and a landscape of diversity efforts in private and public worksites. Literature on campus diversity efforts looks at ethnic and racial diversity through the lens of faculty, staff, and students, with consistent themes of recruitment, retention, and support. Three ways in which colleges tend to engage in these efforts is through individual, interactional, or institutional strategies. Individual efforts include faculty and student mentoring, interactional efforts include cultivating buyin and building an environment conducive to diversity, and institutional efforts include larger scale actions a department or institution takes to reorient itself towards improving diversity.

Colleges and universities around the country are beginning to recognize and invest in diversity. Across worksites institutional leaders are establishing mentorship programs, targeted pilots for hiring, creating institutional diversity offices, and award programs to

the role of diversity, equity and inclusion throughout the Vision for Success. This approach

Opportunity plan templates, and multiple measures certification forms by September 2020. This will require the Chancellor's Office to collaborate with the Consultation Council and existing statewide advisories. (See Attachment 3: California Community Colleges Diversity, Equity and Inclusion Statement)

Recommendation 3: Support the updated 2020~~2021~~ budget proposal submitted by the Task force, to augment statewide resources that will advance the implementation of the diversity, equity and inclusion integration plan. This proposal calls for \$60.4 million in ongoing funding and \$16 million in on-time funding. (See Attachment 4: Updated 2020 21 Faculty and Staff Diversity Budget Change Proposal).

Works Cited

Hurtado, S. (2001). Linking Diversity and Educational Purpose: How Diversity Affects the Classroom Environment and Student Development.

Robinson, Petra A., Byrd, David, Louis, Dave A. & Bonner, Fred A. (2013). Enhancing Faculty Diversity at Community Colleges: A Practical Solution for Advancing the Completion Agenda. Focus on Colleges, Universities

Item 2.8, Attachment 1: Faculty Feedback Collected at the ASCCC Spring Plenary April 2019

Academic Senate Responses

At the April 12, 2019 Academic Senate for California Community Colleges (ASCCC) Plenary, President Dr. John Stankas and Deputy Chancellor Dr. Daisy Gonzales led a session to collect feedback from Senate Presidents related to diversity and Equal Employment Opportunity (EEO) programs and practices. Over 300 participants were asked to discuss and document responses to a set of four questions. The first two questions aimed at collecting information about their local community concerning diversity. The second set of questions aimed to provide a sense of direction for the Chancellor's Office, the Academic Senate and the Vision for Success Diversity, Equity and Inclusion Taskforce. When reviewing the responses, trends began to emerge. Each trend is broken down into categories and includes a list of responses that appeared at least once. The trends are in

Question 2: What are some of the challenges on your campus to promote faculty diversity?

- x The cost of living is becoming a hindrance for employees because of their low salaries.
- x A rural community with a lack of diversity in the hiring pool. Also, having small hiring pools with a limited amount of qualified candidates.
- x Lack of current faculty diversity to serve on hiring committees. The existing administration is primarily composed of white males.
- x Inadequate Training and expertise in EEO and Human Resource departments.
- x A campus culture that hinders the conversation of diversity. This was expressed in the following ways:

Concerns about reverse racism.

People are reluctant to discuss racial and ethnic diversity and only use diversity in the broadest sense.

Difficulty implementing hiring manual recommendations without unduly burdening existing faculty of color.

Lack of opportunity for meaningful dialogue.

Faculty backlash for focusing on diversity.

Leadership perceives diversity as race alone.

Trainings in communication that include: conflict resolution, mediation, coalition building.

x Policy Changes that:

Make the diversification of faculty, classified staff and administration as a required area of the equity plan.

Challenge the legislature to update laws restricting the applicant's self-revealing information such as ethnic background, gender, and cultural identities.

x Resources such as:

Disaggregate data by discipline.

A list of professional organizations geared toward diverse groups to advertise to.

More statistics about the local population versus the faculty/staff at the colleges.

Item 2.8, Attachment 2: *Vision for Success* Diversity, Equity and Inclusion Integration Plan

Background

The Vision for Success Diversity, Equity, and Inclusion Task force (Task force) identified a set of diversity strategies based on research and diversity efforts by state and national institutions. The strategies were adopted as recommendations focused on a theory of change. The theory of change states that, if educational achievement and social mobility for California Community College (CCC) students is intrinsic in the Vision for Success, then faculty and staff diversity are a key driver for this work. Furthermore, community colleges and districts must be empowered to design, implement and reinforce policies, procedures and individual behaviors that serve to cultivate an inclusive ecosystem focused on equity and mutual respect in order to recruit, retain and support a diverse workforce that is continually responsive to the needs of a diverse student population.

The proposed diversity strategies are part of a system-wide integration plan to address faculty and staff diversity, including full-time and part-time faculty, classified staff, and educational administrators. The plan is an organizational strategy meant to help guide the future work of statewide organizations who will be engaging in the development and implementation of these strategies. The Task force recommends that this Integration Plan be treated as a roadmap that can be continually updated and should be annually revised to account for progress towards the strategies and activities listed, and adapt to the ongoing needs of the California Community College System.

Integrated Strategies

The integration plan assumes the proposed recruitment, retention, and support strategies can be adopted at the system and local level within 1-5 years (in some cases multiyear) to change equal employment opportunity (EEO) policies, procedures, and practices in collaboration with stakeholder associations and the Consultation Council.

These strategies and the related activities fall into three categories:

1. Institutional strategies driven by policy changes.
2. Interactional strategies driven by changes to existing procedures.
3. Individual strategies driven by activities that promote supportive and inclusive behaviors.

In addition, the proposed institutional, interactional and individual strategies are aligned to the Vision for Success core commitments. The Task force affirms that because faculty and staff diversity is a driver for the educational achievement and social mobility of our students, the Integration Plan as a whole helps our system achieve the first commitment in the Vision for Success—focus relentlessly on students end goals.

Below, every strategy is aligned to a Vision for Success commitment. Under every strategy,

Tier 1 Activity: HR and ASCCC to disseminate information on how selection committee

Tier 1 Activity: Chancellor's Office EEO and Diversity Advisory Committee to re-evaluate the activity update process and accountability measures for diversity.

Strategy C:

Strategy F: Adopt a statewide diversity statement and incorporate the diversity statement into the mission of the California Community College System. Encourage colleges to adopt a diversity statement as part of their mission statement.

Tier 1

Tier 1 Activity: HR, Administration, Department Chairs and Student Services to collaborate on updating faculty hiring procedures and methods to include open houses.

Tier 1 Activity: CCCCO to provide guidance on best practice hiring procedures.

Strategy B: Design professional development workshops to increase knowledge

Tier 1 Activity: ASCCC to provide guidance for evaluation and tenure review committees.

Tier 1 Activity: CCCCCO partner to create a model for performance evaluation criteria with ASCCC and ACHRO that holds all employees accountable for successfully serving diverse student populations.

Strategy D: Conduct exit interviews of faculty who leave.

Tier 1 Activity: CCCCCO and ACHRO to develop model language for exit interviews to assess perspectives on how the prevailing culture impacts diversity, attitudes towards diverse student and employee groups, awareness and success of diversity programs, likelihood of recommending districts to diverse job applicants, impact of current level of diversity on decision to leave.

Tier 1 Activity: Districts and colleges to collect data about those exit interviews to inform strategies for improving retention.

Strategy E: Provide equivalency guidance and professional development.

Tier 1 Activity: CCCCCO and ASCCC to partner to release statewide guidance on equivalency process and policies.

Tier 1 Activity: CCCCCO require that equivalency committees receive the same training as hiring committees.

Vision for Success Commitment 7: Lead the work of partnering across systems

Strategy A: Diversify hiring or screening committees with members of diverse educational background, gender, and ethnicity.

Tier 1 Activity: ASCCC and ACHRO to provide guidance on hiring committees: examples to diversify committee, what these committees should look like, and models for candidate evaluation.

Tier 1 Activity: ACHRO to develop a model to evaluate the composition of local hiring committees with a diversity, equity, and inclusion lens, and partner with CCCCCO and ASCCC to release statewide guidance.

Tier 1 Activity: ASCCC and HR to develop model job descriptions, vacancy announcements, screening criteria, interview questions, and other employee selection procedure language to establish the ability of the system to attract and retain a diverse workforce.

Tier 2 Activity: Districts and colleges to revise their policies and procedures every 5 years and include cross-functional staff in hiring and screening committees (i.e. including staff from other disciplines, departments, divisions, classified staff, etc.).

Tier 2 Activity: CCCCCO and ACHRO create modules that outline a process for improving and diversifying screening and hiring committees to provide guidance to the field.

List of Individual Diversity Strategies

Vision for Success Commitment 2: Always design and decide with the student in mind

Strategy A: Provide campus-wide cultural competency and implicit bias training.

Tier 1 Activity: CCCCCO create an online module on cultural competency, implicit bias, and longitudinal analysis to upload to the Vision Resource Center and any relevant websites.

Tier 2 Activity: ACHRO, Association of California Community College Administrators (ACCCA), Association of Chief Business Officers (ACBO), ASCCC, classified senate leaders, and union leaders to develop principles to integrate cultural competency into all existing statewide association certificate programs.

Strategy B: Provide professional support for classified staff to build capacity and career growth with an emphasis on equity and diversity.

Tier 1 Activity: CCCCCO to evaluate how the caring campus pilot program can be scaled and the resources that would be needed.

Tier 2 Activity: CCCCCO to advocate for additional systemwide professional development support with an equity and diversity lens for classified staff in 2020-21.

Strategy C: Encourage and facilitate dialogue between ASCCC and Administration on faculty evaluation processes to demonstrate continued commitment to diversity.

Tier 1 Activity: CCCCCO collaborate with the ASCCC, CCLC, ACHRO, and unions to facilitate this dialogue at statewide conferences.

Tier 2 Activity: BOG to create a workgroup with a set timeline to require CCCCCO, ASCCC, ACHRO, and unions to develop model performance evaluation criteria and procedures to hold all employees accountable for successfully serving diverse student populations.

Vision for Success Commitment 3: Pair high expectations with high support

Strategy A: Establish pipeline programs to diversify the faculty applicant pools.

Tier 1 Activity: ASCCC and CCCCCO partner to provide statewide guidance and clarity on minimum qualifications (preferred vs required).

Tier 2 Activity: CCCCCO to secure funding to create a statewide internship program and pipeline for graduate students to teach at California Community Colleges.

Strategy B: Provide faculty and staff (classified and administrators) mentoring opportunities at colleges.

Tier 1 Activity: ASCCC and CCLC collaborate to educate districts, colleges, trustees, and CEO's on the impact of mentoring programs.

Tier 2 Activity: ASCCC and ACHRO to create guidelines to develop local forums for dialogue.

Vision for Success Commitment 6: Enable action and thoughtful innovation

Strategy A: Recognize and support faculty and staff (classified and administrators)

Item 2.8, Attachment 3: California Community Colleges Diversity, Equity and Inclusion Statement

With the goal of ensuring the equal educational opportunity for all our students, faculty, staff, and the communities we serve as an integral part of our history, a recognition of the complexity of our present state, and a call to action for a better future. Embracing diversity means that we must intentionally practice acceptance and respect towards one another and understand that discrimination and prejudices create and sustain privileges for some while creating and sustaining disadvantages for others. In order to embrace racial and group differences

Understanding as an educational community.

Equity, equity, inclusion, and social justice for the success of our students. We must honor that each individual is unique and that our success is dependent on the ability of the colleges to prepare students on their own terms. We require that we develop and implement policies and procedures that promote racial and systemic change, continually reflect on our efforts, and report on the results of our efforts in accomplishing our goals. In California Community Colleges are committed to fostering an environment of equal employment opportunity for all.

At each individual colleges, we are invested in cultivating and promoting an environment of equity and mutual respect are both intrinsic and explicit by welcoming students from all backgrounds, demographics, and experiences. These experiences can include, but are not limited to the following: race, national origin or ancestry, citizenship, immigration status, sexual orientation, physical or mental disability, medical condition, genetic information, registered domestic partner status, age, political beliefs, marital status, socioeconomic status, and any other basis prohibited by state or federal law or ordinance or regulation. We acknowledge that diversity and inclusion is ever evolving, thus we create space to allow for growth and change through the periodic review of this statement.

It input into the development of the 2020 California Community Colleges Budget and Legislative Request. To submit a budget or statutory request, please upload this completed form at [Dropbox](#)

_____ (<http://tinyurl.com/y4v89y4v>) by June 21, 2019 For consideration, proposals should advance the [Vision for Success](https://www.cccco.edu/-/media/CCCCO-Website/About-Us/Reports/Files/vision-for-success.ashx) (<https://www.cccco.edu/-/media/CCCCO-Website/About-Us/Reports/Files/vision-for-success.ashx>). The Chancellor will make the final determination regarding items included in the proposed 2020-21 Budget and Legislative Request. While submissions will not receive individual responses from the Chancellor's Office, items selected for potential inclusion will likely require [Budget Change Proposal](#) (http://www.dof.ca.gov/budget/resources_for_departments/budget_forms/documents/D

equal educational opportunity for all students. This is an augmentation to the existing EEO fund allocation.

- x \$15 million one-time to establish a Statewide Pilot Fellowship program to improve faculty diversity hiring. This program has been proposed by the Consultation Council for several years. Establishing a statewide fellowship program has been proven nationally as a successful strategy to diversify worksites in the public and private sector.
- x \$1 million one-time to modernize the CCC Registry and add system-wide online trainings such as cultural competency and unconscious bias training.
- x \$40 million ongoing for full-time faculty hiring.
- x \$407,699 ongoing general fund to provide additional support for Chancellor's Office positions that will provide leadership in statewide best practices and closely monitor EEO plan implementation and district reporting obligations. (1 Vice Chancellor-Exempt position, 1 Specialist, 1 Staff Services Analyst)

Analyze all feasible alternatives

The only alternative to a budget investment is continuing to use existing limited resources to piece together trainings and tools with external stakeholders and focusing on compliance to submit a state report. Without resources, our colleges and districts will only be able to report how they have attempted to comply and make improvements without resources. This approach is unsustainable, and greatly impacts the system's ability to enact and advance the large-scale reforms required by the Vision for Success.

Strongest arguments in support of proposed solution

California Education Code section 87100 requires "a workforce that is continually responsive to the needs of a diverse student population [which] may be achieved by ensuring that all persons receive an equal opportunity to compete for employment and promotion within the community college districts and by eliminating barriers to equal employment opportunity." Maintaining a richly diverse workforce is not only required by law, but these policies provide our students with the educational benefits of a diverse workforce. The investments requested represent the best thinking across system-wide stakeholders who are experts in our system's policies and practices, and have engaged in a taskforce convening over a period of 6 months.

Fiscal analysis and justification

This proposal calls for \$60.4 million in ongoing funding and \$16 million in one-time funding. These structural investments are only one part of the institutional changes needed to provide colleges and districts resources, support and guidance. While the proposal can be phased-in over 1-2 years, the need for ongoing funding will be critical to these efforts. The largest investment is needed to diversify the faculty in our system through full-time positions. A strong partnership with the Academic Senate for California Community Colleges will need to be ongoing and address major hiring processes such as equivalency and hiring committee trainings. This request includes \$40 million ongoing for

full-time faculty positions because without connecting future hiring to statewide diversity efforts, the system will continue to play catch up to fill limited vacancies with diverse candidates.

Describe previous state or federal legislation, policy or fiscal efforts, or hearings on the subject

EEO statutes are codified in California Education Code sections 87100-87108, and implementing regulations are found at title 5, California Code of Regulations sections 53000- 53034. The State legislature has been interested in this topic across segments over the last decade, and a proposed Assembly hearing is planned for Fall 2019.

Additional Information

This proposal will require statewide system support as significant Proposition 98 dollars will be needed to prioritize increasing faculty and staff diversity in our system. Additionally, the issue of part-time faculty and staff was not addressed in this proposal.

The Task force is Co-chaired by the Chancellor's Office and the Academic Senate for California Community Colleges (ASCCC) and includes presidents/CEO's, faculty, HR managers, trustees, researchers, students and Chancellor's Office staff. The Task force met between April and September 2019 and will present to the Board a systemic plan to improve faculty and staff diversity at the September and November 2019 Board meetings. Task force Roster:

- x Dr. John Stankas, ASCCC President (Co-Chair)
- x Mayra Cruz, ASCCC, DeAnza College
- x Dr. Edward Bush, President, Cosumnes River College
- x Dr. Martha Garcia, Superintendent/President, Imperial Valley College
- x Marisa Perez, Trustee, Cerritos CCD
- x Loren Steck, Trustee, Monterey Peninsula CCD
- x Irma Ramos, ACHRO, North Orange CCD
- x Greg Smith, ACHRO, Shasta College
- x Hildegard B. Aguinaldo, Board of Governors Member
- x Alexis Zaragoza, Board of Governors Student Member
- x Dr. Daisy Gonzales, Chancellor's Office (Co-Chair)
- x Fermin Villegas, Chancellor's Office
- x Ebony Lopez, Chancellor's Office
- x

Contact Information

Proposal Primary Contact: Dr. Daisy Gonzales

Division/Organization/College: CCCCCO

Email Address: dgonzales@cccco.edu

Approval for Submission

To be considered for inclusion in the 2020-21 Budget and Legislative Request the proposal must be approved by one of the following, as appropriate: Chancellor's Office Division Executive Vice Chancellor, Vice Chancellor or Chief Counsel, Consultation Council representative, or district/college Chief Executive Officer or General Counsel.

Approved By: Dr. Daisy Gonzales

Title: Deputy Chancellor

Email this completed form to Imran Majid and Hilary Thomson by June 28, 2019.

Please email [Imran Majid](mailto:imajid@cccco.edu) (imajid@cccco.edu) or [Hilary Thomson](mailto:hthomson@cccco.edu) (hthomson@cccco.edu) with any questions or comments.

Item 2.8, Attachment 5: Board Resolution Adopting Recommendations from the Diversity, Equity and Inclusion Task Force

Resolution of the Board of Governors

California Community Colleges

No. 2019-19

WHEREAS, the California Community Colleges comprise the nation's largest postsecondary education system in the country with 115 colleges and 2.1 million students, who together include the full spectrum of diversity represented by the population of California; and

WHEREAS, the diversity of faculty, classified staff and administrators employed by the

WHEREAS, the Chancellor of the California Community Colleges convened a Diversity, Equity and Inclusion Task force to develop recommendations for the Board to advance our efforts to diversify the population of community colleges employees.